

Public Document Pack



Neuadd y Sir
Y Rhadyr
Brynbuga
NP15 1GA

County Hall
Rhadyr
Usk
NP15 1GA

12th November 2024

Notice of Reports Received following Publication of Agenda.

Remuneration Committee

Tuesday, 19th November, 2024 at 2.00 pm,
Room M1 – County Hall, Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA

Attached are reports that the committee will consider as part of the original agenda but were submitted to democratic services following publication of the agenda.

Item No	Item	Pages
4.	Independent Review for Senior Leadership Pay – Recommendations.	1 - 20

Paul Matthews
Chief Executive

This page is intentionally left blank

SUBJECT:	INDEPENDENT REVIEW FOR SENIOR LEADERSHIP PAY
MEETING:	REMUNERATION COMMITTEE
DATE:	19TH NOVEMBER 2024
DIVISION/ WARDS AFFECTED:	ALL WARDS

PURPOSE:

To consider the independent review by Anne Philimore, FCIPD, HR Consultant and to make recommendations on the salary structures for Strategic Leadership Team as they are not comparable with other councils in the Gwent area/Borders.

1. RECOMMENDATIONS:

That Committee:

1. Approve the recommendation in the independent review that Strategic Leadership Team are paid in accordance with Option 2 and that the increase is spread over 2 years.
2. Recommend that a job evaluation scheme is put in place for all Chief Offgrades and that the pay structures are reviewed.

2. KEY ISSUES:

Monmouthshire is strategically placed as the gateway to southeast Wales which means that we work alongside our neighbouring Welsh authorities and those along the borders. Therefore, we are competing with Welsh and English Local Authorities to attract our people. They are our greatest asset and make us an employer of choice. But the challenges we face are great and at times like these we need high-calibre senior staff to drive the council's strategic goals forward. As set out in our Community and Corporate Plan 2022-2028, many years of austerity have made the council a lean organisation, and increasing budgetary pressures require fundamental changes in how services are delivered. In order to take the council forward we need senior leaders who promote our values whilst being innovative.

Monmouthshire County Council (MCC) last evaluated its salary bands for its Strategic Leadership Team in 2009. Since this time other Local Authorities have re-evaluated their pay scales to remain competitive and to attract talented senior leadership professionals. Whilst we punch above our weight, in terms of the calibre of strategic leaders we have been able to recruit and develop, the salary offered is starting to impact on the attractiveness of the package offered.

This was recognised by Cabinet and the previous Chief Officer for People and Governance was tasked with instructing Anne Phillimore, FCIPD, HR Consultant to review the Chief Executive Officer and Chief Officer Remuneration of MCC. This work was commissioned by Cabinet and sanctioned by the Leader who has asked Cllr Callard to be the principal Cabinet member lead.

Anne Phillimore is an experienced public sector HR Consultant. She has undertaken similar reviews in other Welsh Local Authorities. She has provided a comprehensive analysis and benchmarking of our remuneration levels against other local authorities. The scope of the independent review is concerned with the remuneration levels for strategic leadership roles including the Chief Executive. This includes 8 roles which are:

- Chief Executive
- Deputy Chief Executive/Chief Officer, Resources (& s.151 Officer)
- Chief Officer, Children and Young People
- Chief Officer, Social Care & Health
- Chief Officer, People, Performance & Partnerships
- Chief Officer, Law & Governance
- Chief Operating Officer, Customer, Culture & Wellbeing
- Chief Officer, Communities & Place

These roles are at paragraph 3 and the pay information is within paragraph 6 within the pay policy 2024.

The reason for instructing an independent review is that these posts are not included in any Job Evaluation Scheme. Cabinet is committed to ensuring that a job evaluation process is revisited for all grades to ensure a fair and equitable pay structure in MCC.

An initial draft of the review was presented to Cllr Callard, Cabinet Member, Resources and the Lead HR Business Partner in June 2024 and amendments were requested to reflect Lower, Median and Top Quartiles so that clear recommendations could be made. An updated review was sent to Cllr Callard and the Lead HR Business Partner in September 2024.

The Review sets out the terms of reference at section 2 and explains the salary benchmarking in section 6. The Recommendations are set out as follows:

- Paragraph 8.1 CEX pay -Tier 1
- Paragraph 8.2 Deputy/Assistant CEX/Strategic Director Tier 2
- Paragraph 8.3 Strategic Director/Director/Chief Officers Tier 3
- Paragraph 8.4 Chief Officers only Tier 4

It should be noted that the Terms of Reference for the review solely focussed on Chief Executive Officer and Chief Officer Remuneration. Two of the current Chief Officers within the Strategic Leadership Team (the Chief Officer, People, Performance & Partnerships, and the Chief Operating Officer, Customer, Culture & Wellbeing) are currently paid on the Tier 4 (Band B) scale. These Tier 4 chief officers are included in the review but the e Head of Service positions also paid within this tier, but they are not part of this review.

The review explains that at present we are not reflecting our market position. At present the roles are attracting the following salaries with the following increases over the next 4 financial years,

	2025/26	2026/27	2027/28	2028/29
Role	Existing	Existing	Existing	Existing
Chief Executive	128,028	128,028	128,028	128,028
Deputy Chief Executive and Chief Officer, Resources (s.151 officer)	100,965	100,965	100,965	100,965
Chief Officer Children and Young People	94,538	94,538	94,538	94,538
Chief Officer Community and Place	94,538	94,538	94,538	94,538
Chief Officer Social Care and Health	94,538	94,538	94,538	94,538
Chief Officer Law and Governance (Monitoring Officer and Head of Democracy)	94,538	94,538	94,538	94,538
Chief Officer People, Performance and Partnership	81,684	82,970	82,970	82,970
Chief Officer Customer, Culture and Well Being	82,970	82,970	82,970	82,970
Total Cost	771,799	773,085	773,085	773,085

It sets out options to consider for each post. They are:

- Option 1 – Lower Quartile
- Option 2 – Median Range
- Option 3 – Mid Point
- Option 4 – Top Quartile

Under each option there is commentary, risks, benefits and recommendations. Option 1 is in effect no change. Option 2 to 4 sets out where in the range there could be an increase. However, Option 4 would provide a substantial increase that would align this tier with larger councils in Wales and England. Monmouthshire has approximately 4,000 members of staff with a population of 93,000 people. Whilst population size provides a useful benchmark, it needs to be taken in conjunction with a range of other variables such as social demography, complexity and geography. This is a generally prosperous county compared to surrounding areas as it occupies a strategic position as a border county between the major centres in South Wales and the south-west of England and the Midlands. It is an economic gateway to South Wales. This means that Option 4 is not a viable option because of our size.

We have set out Option 2 as recommended by Anne Philimore. Cabinet have stated that they would wish any changes to take effect from April 2025 and to be implanted over two financial years to limit the impact on its medium financial term plan (MFTP).

3. EQUALITY AND FUTURE GENERATIONS EVALUATION (INCLUDES SOCIAL JUSTICE, SAFEGUARDING AND CORPORATE PARENTING):

The aim of this report is to provide an independent, transparent and informed approach to managing senior pay which doesn't disproportionately affect protected characteristics.

4. OPTIONS APPRAISAL

The recommendations for the senior officers are set out below.

Chief Executive Officer – Tier 1

Anne has recommended that pay is revised in line with Option 2 because it moves the CEX salary into the lower part of the median quartile, circa £138k-£148k. £138k would take the salary just into the median quartile and would still be at the lower end of Welsh Council tier 1 salaries but would align more closely with population relativities. This pay range would also have the benefit of substantially reducing the number of organisations paying tier 2 and tier 3 staff above this rate and should increase the number of candidates available for this role in the fullness of time. This scale of increase, although substantial, would both keep Monmouthshire in line with similar organisations and provide some headroom in respect of salary levels at tier 2 and 3.

Deputy Chief Executive and Chief Officer, Resources (s.151 officer) -Tier 2

Anne has recommended that pay is revised in line with Option 2 because it moves the tier 2 salary into the lower part of the median quartile circa £112k-£125k. This would take the salary just into the median quartile though would still be toward the lower end of Welsh Councils. This scale of increase – although not insubstantial, would both keep Monmouthshire in line with similar organisations and provide some headroom in respect of salary levels at tier 2 and 3. To ensure the acceptability of this increase, posts within the scale could be spot salaries which would control the pay bill; or there could be a scale of two or three points with a gateway beyond which progression would be linked to additional responsibilities – again this would provide some pay bill control.

Chief Officer Children and Young People, Chief Officer Community and Place, Chief Officer Social Care and Health, Chief Officer Law and Governance (Monitoring Officer and Head of Democracy) – Tier 3

Anne has recommended that pay is revised in line with Option 2 because the move the tier 3 salary into the lower part of the median quartile circa £103k -113k. This would take the salary into the median quartile and would then benchmark up to the mid-point of the salary scale. This level of increase – although substantial, would both keep Monmouthshire in line with similar organisations and provide some headroom in respect of salary levels at tier 4. To ensure the acceptability of this increase, posts within the scale could be spot salaries which would control the pay bill; or there could be a scale of two or three points with a gateway beyond which progression would be linked to additional responsibilities – again this would provide some pay bill control

Chief Officer People, Performance and Partnership and Chief Officer Customer, Culture and Well Being – Tier 4

Anne has recommended that pay is revised in line with Option 2 because it increases the tier 4 salary scale into the lower part of the median quartile circa £85k-£93k. This would take the salary into the median quartile which would then benchmark up to the mid-point. This scale of increase would both keep Monmouthshire in line with similar organisations and provide scope for a run through salary structure at this level and tier 5 and below. To ensure the acceptability of this increase, posts within the scale. To ensure the acceptability of this increase, posts within the scale could be spot salaries which would control the pay bill; or there could be a scale of two or three points with a gateway beyond which progression would be linked to additional responsibilities – again this would provide some pay bill control.

The result of accepting these recommendations would be an increase in pay from the 1st April 2025 as follows:

	2025/26	2025/26
Role	Existing	Revised
Chief Executive	128,028	131,352
Deputy Chief Executive and Chief Officer, Resources (s.151 officer)	100,965	104,643
Chief Officer Children and Young People	94,538	97,359
Chief Officer Community and Place	94,538	97,359
Chief Officer Social Care and Health	94,538	97,359
Chief Officer Law and Governance (Monitoring Officer and Head of Democracy)	94,538	97,359
Chief Officer People, Performance and Partnership	81,684	83,647
Chief Officer Customer, Culture and Well Being	82,970	83,647

After which they increase until the end of 2028/29 and then become a spot salary.

	2026/27	2027/28	2028/29
Role	Revised	Revised	Revised
Chief Executive	134,676	138,000	141,000
Deputy Chief Executive and Chief Officer, Resources (s.151 officer)	108,322	112,000	116,000
Chief Officer Children and Young People	100,179	103,000	106,000
Chief Officer Community and Place	100,179	103,000	106,000
Chief Officer Social Care and Health	100,179	103,000	106,000
Chief Officer Law and Governance (Monitoring Officer and Head of Democracy)	100,179	103,000	106,000
Chief Officer People, Performance and Partnership	84,323	85,000	88,000
Chief Officer Customer, Culture and Well Being	84,323	85,000	88,000

5. EVALUATION CRITERIA

The purpose of this report is to consider the Independent Review of the Chief Executive Officer and Chief Officer Remuneration and to enable members to make recommendations.

6. REASONS:

It is important that we have the ongoing ability to attract and retain high caliber leaders capable of delivering a complex agenda of the coming years. This will ensure that there is strong and effective leadership to achieve the Council's strategic objectives. Our senior leadership play a pivotal role in shaping and implementing the Council's vision and strategies. They also cement our organisational values as they matter to us and set out our expectations for ourselves, each other, and the way we conduct business with organisations that we work with.

As stated in our pay policy 2024, Monmouthshire County Council recognises that in the context of managing scarce public resources remuneration at all levels needs to be adequate to secure and retain high quality employees dedicated to the service of the public, but at the same time needs to avoid being unnecessarily generous or excessive.

Competitive pay structures contribute to a positive organisational culture by demonstrating the Council's commitment to valuing and rewarding its staff. This, in turn, fosters employee engagement, motivation, and loyalty, which are crucial for our success. We want to continue to be an employer of choice.

7. RESOURCE IMPLICATIONS:

If the recommendations from the independent review are agreed, then the resource implications are as follows. They are set out below to show what the current salaries are and then the revised salaries with the associated cost pressures.

	2025/26	2026/27	2027/28	2028/29
Role	Revised	Revised	Revised	Revised
Chief Executive	131,352	134,676	138,000	141,000
Deputy Chief Executive and Chief Officer, Resources (s.151 officer)	104,643	108,322	112,000	116,000
Chief Officer Children and Young People	97,359	100,179	103,000	106,000
Chief Officer Community and Place	97,359	100,179	103,000	106,000
Chief Officer Social Care and Health	97,359	100,179	103,000	106,000
Chief Officer Law and Governance (Monitoring Officer and Head of Democracy)	97,359	100,179	103,000	106,000
Chief Officer People, Performance and Partnership	83,647	84,323	85,000	88,000
Chief Officer Customer, Culture and Well Being	83,647	84,323	85,000	88,000
Total Cost	792,723	812,362	832,000	857,000
Cost Increase	20,924	39,277	58,915	83,915
Employers Costs increase	7,742	14,532	21,799	31,049
Total budget increase required	28,666	53,809	80,714	114,964

8. CONSULTEES:

Cabinet colleagues continue to be consulted on the process and engagement with Trade Unions is ongoing.

Justine Cass, Deputy Monitoring Officer, Torfaen Council Borough Council and Jonathan Davies, Head of Finance & Acting Section 151 Officer, Monmouthshire County Council have been consulted and advised on this matter.

9. BACKGROUND PAPERS:

Monmouthshire's Summary of Recommendations

Slides for the Remuneration Committee

Independent Review including:

- Appendix A References
- Appendix B Reviewer Biography
- Appendix C Comparative Local Authority Salaries -South/Mid Wales examples.
- Appendix D Comparative Local Authority Salaries – English examples
- Appendix E(i) Tier 1 set out the Council benchmark data.
- Appendix E (ii) Tier 2 set out the Council benchmark data.
- Appendix E (iii) Tier 3 set out the Council benchmark data.
- Appendix E (iv) Tier 4 set out the Council benchmark data.
- Appendix F Local Authority Benchmarks by population
- Appendix G Pay levels for senior civil servants in Wales
- Appendix H Salary levels for NHS Wales CEO's and Directors

Terms of Reference

Governance for the Remuneration Committee

People Strategy -

Pay Policy 2024 - [Pay Policy 2024 \(monmouthshire.gov.uk\)](https://www.monmouthshire.gov.uk)

10. AUTHOR:

Julie Anthony, Lead HR Business Partner, Monmouthshire County Council

11. CONTACT DETAILS:

Julie Anthony, Lead HR Business Partner, Monmouthshire County Council

Tel: 07584 600408

E-mail: JulieAnthony@monmouthshire.gov.uk

This page is intentionally left blank



SENIOR LEADERSHIP TEAM REMUNERATION COMMITTEE

TERMS OF REFERENCE

Dated: 1st July 2024

DRAFT SENIOR LEADERSHIP TEAM REMUNERATION COMMITTEE

TERMS OF REFERENCE

1. Scope

To determine the remuneration for the Council's Senior Leadership Team which consists of the Chief Executive and 7 Chief Officers.

The purpose of the review is that there is a risk that the authority will not be able to attract qualified and competent chief officers due to uncompetitive pay arrangements.

The issue is about balancing the need for senior pay to beset in a fair, transparent way and be deemed an appropriate use of public funds, with the equal need to attract and reward leaders of sufficient calibre to drive a constant process of change and improvement.

We have a track record of creativity and innovation. We will need to build on this so that we are:

- A Fair place to live where the effects of inequality and poverty have been reduced;
- A Green place to live and work, with reduced carbon emissions, and making a positive contribution to addressing the climate and nature emergency;
- A Thriving and ambitious place, where there are vibrant town centres, where businesses can grow and develop;
- A Safe place to live where people have a home and community where they feel secure;
- A Connected place where people feel part of a community and are valued;
- A Learning place where everybody has the opportunity to reach their potential

2. Background

Local Authorities are required to be transparent as to how they use public monies. They have to publish each financial year a pay policy setting out its remuneration for its chief officers.

The **Localism Act 2011 (section 38 (4))** states that a pay statement must include the authority's policies relating to:

- (a) the level and elements of remuneration for each chief officer,
- (b) remuneration of chief officers on recruitment,
- (c) increases and additions to remuneration for each chief officer,
- (d) the use of performance-related pay for chief officers,
- (e) the use of bonuses for chief officers,

- (f) the approach to the payment of chief officers on their ceasing to hold office under or to be employed by the authority, and
- (g) the publication of and access to information relating to remuneration of chief officers.

A Chief Officer is defined in **s.43(2)** of the **Localism Act 2011** as:

(aa) its chief executive appointed under—

- (i) section 54 of the Local Government and Elections (Wales) Act 2021 (chief executive of council in Wales), or
- (ii) regulations made under Part 5 of that Act (chief executive of a corporate joint committee).

(b) its monitoring officer designated under section 5(1) of the Local Government and Housing Act 1989;

(c) a statutory chief officer mentioned in section 2(6) of that Act;

(d) a non-statutory chief officer mentioned in section 2(7) of that Act;

(e) a deputy chief officer mentioned in section 2(8) of that Act;

(f) its head of democratic services designated under section 8(1) of the Local Government (Wales) Measure 2011 (designation by council of a county or county borough in Wales).

s.54(3) of **The Local Government and Election (Wales) Act 2021** requires the Chief Executive to keep under review such matters as:

(a) the manner in which the exercise by the council of its different functions is co-ordinated;

(b) the council's arrangements in relation to—

- (i) financial planning,
- (ii) asset management, and
- (iii) risk management;

(c) the number and grades of staff required by the council for the exercise of its functions;

(d) the organisation of the council's staff;

(e) the appointment of the council's staff;

(f) the arrangements for the management of the council's staff (including arrangements for training and development).

3. Decision

All decisions will be made in accordance with the following principles: (a) proportionately (i.e. the action must be proportionate to the desired outcome); (b) due consideration and the taking of professional advice from Officers; (c) respect for human rights; (d) a presumption in favour of openness; (e) clarity of aims and desired outcomes; (f) consideration of any

alternative options; and (g) the giving and recording of reasons for the decision and the proper recording of these reasons.

The committee has to:-

- Make recommendations on senior pay and reward issues to Council
- Make recommendations on structure of senior pay and reward, and grounds for pay progression.
- To comply with the requirements set out in the Local Government (Wales) Act 2015, and any subsequent legislation, which relate to senior pay decisions. The committee and the Council must have regard to any Independent Remuneration Committee's recommendations when reaching decisions on relevant pay. Appendix 1 provides the process to refer any pay recommendations to the Independent Remuneration Committee (IRP).

The terms of reference will be subject to approval by Council.

4. General Principles

- No permanent change to pay and reward of the Senior Leadership Team can be actioned until it is ratified by Full Council
- The basic pay of the Senior Leadership Team (including the Chief Executive) will be determined using an Independent HR Consultant and advice sought from any other external experts as deemed appropriate.
- The Committee will provide a structured governance body through which recommendations affecting Chief Officers pay can be taken in the best interests of Monmouthshire County Council and its stakeholders. It enables remuneration issues to be reviewed and considered with an impartial and balanced mind-set.

5. Role

The Remuneration Committee will make recommendations to Council on the permanent pay and reward of Senior Managers. It will:-

- a) Contribute to the Council's positive reputation with regard to having appropriate and effective corporate governance arrangements for senior pay by operating an independent, transparent and informed approach to managing senior pay through the Remuneration Committee.
- b) Develop broad policy decision for senior pay, having regard to the Council's Pay Policy 2024
- c) Propose levels of remuneration considered to be sufficient to attract, retain and motivate senior managers of the quality required to run the organisation successfully.
- d) Consider the affordability of its proposals
- e) Be sensitive to the context of senior pay, including pay and employment conditions elsewhere in the organisation
- f) Ensure the relationship between reward and senior management tiers and for employees below this level remain reasonable
- g) Ensure individuals are fairly and responsibly rewarded for their individual contribution
- h) Understand what other relevant organisations are paying for similar roles as well as their general approach to reward, and consider whether Monmouthshire County Council should position itself in relation to 'the market' – for example, whether the Council's approach may be to pay at around the lower quartile, median or upper quartile of the market etc.

i) Ensure that proper and professional advice is obtained to assist in its deliberations

The committee's recommendations will be based on data, advice, evidence and views collected from a number of possible sources – for example:

- External pay data, advice and facilitation (e.g. from external consultants or other sources)
- The Council's Chief Executive, key documents and reports

The Council's policies such as People Strategy

- Performance data where relevant

The committee would not normally expect to present all of the background data and advice it had received

6. Membership & Support

The committee will comprise of 6 Members to give a balanced political background. One member of the committee will act as Chair. The Chair will be appointed at the first meeting.

The membership should include the Lead Member for Resources and one member from Cabinet.

The Lead HR Business Partner will provide a 'secretariat' function to the Committee because she is not part of SLT or a Head of Service. She will be responsible for arranging meetings, coordinating and preparing documentation and arranging support, training, advice and information for the Committee.

The Committee may commission external independent expertise to train and support them in fulfilling their role and/or to provide external data or advice (including relevant market and regional data). The Lead HR Business Partner will provide details of external experts considered suitable for the purposes in terms of experience, cost and best value for the Committee to select from.

7. Confidentiality

Members will be expected to maintain confidentiality whilst discussions are taking place and until the decisions have been published.

8. Conflicts of Interest

Should any committee member feel there is a conflict of interest with regards to any agenda item or discussion in the committee:-

- They should declare any personal and/or prejudicial interest in the matter
- It is prejudicial then they should leave the meeting during any discussion on the matter

Appendix One

Process to refer pay decisions to Independent Remuneration Committee (IRP)

The Independent Remuneration Panel for Wales Statutory Guidance for the Remuneration of Chief Executives will be relied upon as in the link below.

<https://www.gov.wales/sites/default/files/pdf-versions/2022/11/2/1668513515/independent-remuneration-panel-wales-statutory-guidance-remuneration-chief-executives.pdf>

The current position is that the IRPW can exercise its functions under section 143A in respect of the remuneration of chief executives of principal councils (county councils and county borough councils).

The IRPW may request any information it needs to assist it to reach a conclusion on the matter and the principal council will be obliged to provide it. The IRPW may publish any recommendation it decides to make.

Principal councils are required to provide the IRPW with any information it may reasonably require in reaching a conclusion and that provides the IRPW with considerable power to gather necessary information. The sort of information the IRPW may require could include the following:

- papers or reports prepared by the Council in relation to the matter
- reports or other information provided to the Council by any consultancy, Trade Union or professional association
- details of the total remuneration package available, or under consideration, for the chief executive. This could include the length of contract on offer, pension arrangements, severance package, payments for any additional duties which are not included in the salary, performance bonuses, provision for annual and other leave, payment in kind (i.e. cars) and relocation costs
- information concerning the remuneration on offer to other principal council chief executives. (Note: the IRPW are not restricted to only requiring information from the principal council/CJC considering a variation in salary)
- details of agreements made at the National Joint Council level

In conclusion, the IRPW will want to satisfy itself the principal council concerned has made a clear business case for a proposed change and examined the options. The view of the IRPW should be taken at the end, not the beginning of the process, in order that the IRPW is able to see all the evidence the council has taken into account in making its proposal. This will be particularly important when an urgent appointment is being considered. If the IRPW's view is required quickly, it will need to have all the background information readily available

This page is intentionally left blank

Governance for the Remuneration Committee

Purpose

The purpose of the Remuneration Committee is to assess the competitiveness of Chief Officer pay and reward instructions and to bring recommendations to full Council.

As a member of the Remuneration Committee, you shall have regard to the Nolan Principles. These are Selflessness, Integrity, Objectivity, Accountability, Openness, Honesty and Leadership. In Wales there are the additional principles of duty to uphold the law, equality and respect and stewardship.

Training

Members will receive an overview of the Council and where it sits alongside its neighbouring authorities, its pay policy, its aims and objectives and its key features of pay structures.

Declarations of Interest

If a recommendation might reasonably be regarded as affecting the financial position of the member, a relative or a friend, or of the organisation the member has an association with, either as an employee, volunteer or manager then the interest must be declared and noted at the commencement of the item to be discussed or when the interest becomes apparent.

The Chair may ask the member to withdraw from the meeting room whilst the matter is being considered at the meeting. The committee will use the Council's Code of Conduct as best practice and the declarations will not be publicly available. The link to the Code of Conduct is attached here

https://www.monmouthshire.gov.uk/app/uploads/2023/05/20230518_Constitution.pdf

Code of Conduct

Members are required to:

- Raise areas of concern and experience in order to make workable and sustainable recommendations.
- Respect of any confidential information provided to support recommendation making.
- Respect the views of other members
- Respectfully challenge the opinions of other members or contributors

Justine Cass
Deputy Monitoring Officer
Torfaen County Borough Council
7th October 2024